

# Supplementary Material: Classification of Sets using Restricted Boltzmann Machines

**Jérôme Louradour**

A2iA SA  
40 bis, rue Fabert  
75007 Paris, France

**Hugo Larochelle \***

Département d'informatique  
Université de Sherbrooke  
Sherbrooke, Canada

## Abstract

We provide here some additional details relatively to our submission, regarding the derivation of the free-energy functions for the two ClassSetRBMs.

## Derivation of the free-energy for ClassSetRBM<sup>XOR</sup>

We provide here the derivation of the free-energy for ClassSetRBM<sup>XOR</sup>. To simplify the derivation, we assume hidden layer sizes of  $H = 1$ . The generalization to arbitrary size is trivial, since the necessary sums factorize for each hidden unit, for the same reason that the conditional over  $\mathbf{H}$  given  $\mathbf{X}$  and  $\mathbf{y}$  factorizes into each of the  $j^{\text{th}}$  hidden unit sets  $\{h_j^s\}$ .

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{e}_c | \mathbf{x}) &= \sum_{\mathbf{H}} p(\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{e}_c, \mathbf{H} | \mathbf{x}) \\ &= \frac{\sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{H}))}{\sum_{\mathbf{H}'} \sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{e}_{c'}, \mathbf{H}'))} \end{aligned} \quad (1)$$

where

$$\begin{aligned} &\sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{H})) \\ &= \sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp\left(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \sum_s \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{h}^{(s)} + \sum_s \left(\mathbf{h}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{W} \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \mathbf{h}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{y}\right)\right) \\ &= \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)}) \sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp\left(\sum_s \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{h}^{(s)} + \sum_s \left(\mathbf{h}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{W} \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \mathbf{h}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{y}\right)\right) \\ &= \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)}) \left(\exp(0) + \sum_s \exp\left(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \cdot \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y}\right)\right) \\ &= \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)}) \left(1 + \exp(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y}) \sum_s \exp\left(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \cdot \mathbf{x}^{(s)}\right)\right) \end{aligned} \quad (2)$$

---

\* This work was done while Hugo was at University of Toronto

where at line 2 we used the mutual exclusivity constraint  $\sum_s h_1^{(s)} \in \{0, 1\}$  over  $\mathbf{H}$ . Hence we can write

$$\begin{aligned} \log \sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{H})) &= \mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \text{softplus} \left( \mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y} + \log \left( \sum_s \exp \left( c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \cdot \mathbf{x}^{(s)} \right) \right) \right) \\ &= \mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X})) \end{aligned}$$

where we use the definition of  $\text{softmax}_j(\mathbf{X})$  for the ClassSetRBM<sup>XOR</sup> (see Section 3.1 of submission). Going back to Equation 1:

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{e}_c | \mathbf{x}) &= \frac{\sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{H}))}{\sum_{\mathbf{H}'} \sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{e}_{c'}, \mathbf{H}'))} \\ &= \frac{\exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X})))}{\sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{e}_{c'} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{e}_{c'} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X})))} \\ &= \frac{\exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X})))}{\sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{e}_{c'} + \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{e}_{c'} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X})))} \\ &= \frac{\exp(-F^{\text{XOR}}(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}))}{\sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(-F^{\text{XOR}}(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{e}_{c'}))} \end{aligned}$$

where we recover  $F^{\text{XOR}}(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}) = -\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} - \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X}))$  for  $H = 1$ . Because of the hidden unit factorization property, we get the general free-energy function  $F^{\text{XOR}}(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}) = -\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} - \sum_{j=1}^H \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_j \cdot \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_j(\mathbf{X}))$  for arbitrary values of  $H$ .

## Derivation of the free-energy for ClassSetRBM<sup>OR</sup>

Again, we provide the derivation of the free-energy for ClassSetRBM<sup>XOR</sup>. Here, we can also simplify the derivation by we assuming hidden layers of size  $H = 1$ .

$$\begin{aligned} p(\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{e}_c | \mathbf{x}) &= \sum_{\mathbf{G}} \sum_{\mathbf{H}} p(\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{e}_c, \mathbf{H}, \mathbf{G} | \mathbf{x}) \\ &= \frac{\sum_{\mathbf{G}} \sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{H}, \mathbf{G}))}{\sum_{\mathbf{G}'} \sum_{\mathbf{H}'} \sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{e}_{c'}, \mathbf{H}', \mathbf{G}'))} \end{aligned} \quad (3)$$

where

$$\begin{aligned}
& \sum_{\mathbf{G}} \sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{H}, \mathbf{G})) \\
&= \sum_{\mathbf{G}} \sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp\left(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \sum_s \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{h}^{(s)} + \sum_s \left(\mathbf{h}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{W} \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \mathbf{g}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{y}\right)\right) \\
&= \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)}) \sum_{\mathbf{G}} \sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp\left(\sum_s \mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{h}^{(s)} + \sum_s \left(\mathbf{h}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{W} \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \mathbf{g}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{U} \mathbf{y}\right)\right) \\
&= \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)}) \left(\exp(0) \left(\sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp\left(\mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{h}^{(s)} + \mathbf{h}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{W} \mathbf{x}^{(s)}\right)\right)\right) \tag{4}
\end{aligned}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
& \quad + \sum_s \exp(\mathbf{U}_1 \mathbf{y}) \left(\sum_{\mathbf{H} \text{ s.t. } h_1^{(s)}=1} \exp\left(\mathbf{c}^\top \mathbf{h}^{(s)} + \mathbf{h}^{(s)\top} \mathbf{W} \mathbf{x}^{(s)}\right)\right) \\
&= \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)}) \left(\exp(0) \prod_{s'} \left(1 + \exp\left(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s')}\right)\right)\right) \tag{5} \\
& \quad + \sum_s \exp(\mathbf{U}_1 \mathbf{y} + c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s)}) \prod_{s' \neq s} \left(1 + \exp\left(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s')}\right)\right) \\
&= \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)}) \left(\prod_{s'} \left(1 + \exp\left(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s')}\right)\right)\right) \left(1 + \exp(\mathbf{U}_1 \mathbf{y}) \sum_s \frac{\exp(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s)})}{1 + \exp(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s)})}\right)
\end{aligned}$$

where at line 4 we used the mutual exclusivity constraint  $\sum_s g_1^{(s)} \in \{0, 1\}$  over  $\mathbf{G}$ , and at line 5 we used the inequality constraint between  $\mathbf{H}$  and  $\mathbf{G}$ ,  $h_1^{(s)} \geq g_1^{(s)} \forall s$ . Hence we can write

$$\begin{aligned}
& \log \sum_{\mathbf{G}} \sum_{\mathbf{H}} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{H}, \mathbf{G})) \\
&= \mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \sum_{s'} \text{softplus}(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s')}) + \text{softplus}\left(\mathbf{U}_1 \mathbf{y} + \log \sum_s \frac{\exp(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s)})}{1 + \exp(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s)})}\right) \\
&= \mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \sum_{s'} \text{softplus}(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s')}) + \text{softplus}\left(\mathbf{U}_1 \mathbf{y} + \log \sum_s \exp(\text{softminus}(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s)}))\right) \\
&= \mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \sum_s \mathbf{b}^\top \mathbf{x}^{(s)} + \sum_{s'} \text{softplus}(c_1 + \mathbf{W}_1 \mathbf{x}^{(s')}) + \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X}))
\end{aligned}$$

where we use the definition of  $\text{softmax}_j(\mathbf{X})$  for the  $\text{ClassSetRBM}^{\text{OR}}$  (see Section 3.2 of submission). Going back to Equation 3:

$$\begin{aligned}
p(\mathbf{y} = \mathbf{e}_c | \mathbf{x}) &= \frac{\sum_{\mathbf{H}} \sum_{\mathbf{G}} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}, \mathbf{H}, \mathbf{G}))}{\sum_{\mathbf{H}'} \sum_{\mathbf{G}'} \sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(-E(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{e}_{c'}, \mathbf{H}', \mathbf{G}'))} \\
&= \frac{\exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} + \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X})))}{\sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{e}_{c'} + \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{e}_{c'} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X})))} \\
&= \frac{\exp(-F^{\text{OR}}(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}))}{\sum_{c'=1\dots C} \exp(-F^{\text{OR}}(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{e}_{c'}))}
\end{aligned}$$

where we recover  $F^{\text{OR}}(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}) = -\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} - \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_1 \cdot \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_1(\mathbf{X}))$  for  $H = 1$ . Again, because of the hidden unit factorization property of  $\text{ClassSetRBM}^{\text{OR}}$ , we get the general free-energy function  $F^{\text{OR}}(\mathbf{X}, \mathbf{y}) = -\mathbf{d}^\top \mathbf{y} - \sum_{j=1}^H \text{softplus}(\mathbf{U}_j \cdot \mathbf{y} + \text{softmax}_j(\mathbf{X}))$  for arbitrary values of  $H$ .